



National Bureau of Statistics
of the Republic of Moldova



United Nations Statistics
Division



United Nations World
Tourism Organization



United Nations Development
Programme

Regional Workshop for the CIS countries

Developing National Systems of Tourism Statistics: Challenges and Good Practices

Chisinau, Republic of Moldova, 29 June -2 July 2010

WORKSHOP REPORT

I - Organization, purpose, objective and participants

The workshop "Developing National Systems of Tourism Statistics: Challenges and Good Practices" was organized by the United Nations Statistics Division (UNSD) in collaboration with the UN World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), the Interstate Statistical Committee of the CIS (CISSTAT) and the National Bureau of Statistics of the Republic of Moldova (NBS), with the support of the United National Development Programme – Moldova. The workshop was hosted by the NBS and took place in Chisinau, Republic of Moldova from 29 June to 02 July 2010.

The objective of the workshop was to assist CIS countries and Georgia in strengthening their statistical capacity in the area of tourism statistics by training them in the *International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 (IRTS 2008)*, as well as by providing advice on practical issues of the implementation. The training focused on both the conceptual issues and good practices in organizing and improving the national programmes of tourism statistics under various country specific circumstances. The workshop aimed also at promoting and facilitating the inter-agency cooperation to ensure that tourism statistics is compiled in an integrated and efficient way and the disseminated data serve the needs of national tourism agencies, national statistical offices and central banks in the best possible way.

All CIS countries and Georgia but Turkmenistan sent representatives. There were representatives from national statistical offices, national tourism authorities and some central banks. The workshop was attended by 55 participants, of which 27 were from the host country, 22 from other CIS countries or Georgia and 6 from international and regional organizations. In addition to UNSD and UNWTO, there were representatives from CISSTAT, EUROSTAT and International Labor Organization (ILO).

II - Summary

(a) Opening session:

Ms. Lucia Spoială, General Director of the National Bureau of Statistics of Moldova opened the workshop by welcoming the participants and stressing the challenge represented by the development of tourism statistics in the region. In addition to UNSD, there were also opening statements by representatives from UNWTO, EUROSTAT, ILO and CISSTAT.

Mr. Kovacs, Chief of the International Trade in Services Section welcomed the participants on behalf of Paul Cheung, Director, UNSD. Mr. Cheung's statement emphasized that the organizers, UNSD and UNWTO see the workshop as an important part of their efforts to assist countries in implementing the International Recommendations for Tourism Statistics 2008 (IRTS 2008) after its adoption by the Statistical Commission. He underlined the importance of the availability of high quality tourism statistics for policy makers and the society at large based. He also stressed the importance of cooperation between those institutions being involved in the production of

tourism statistics, namely the national statistical office, the national tourism authority and the central bank.

(b) Presentations and discussions:

The following topics were discussed at the workshop:

- Session 3: Status of tourism statistics. Eurostat and CISSTAT presented overviews of tourism statistics in their respective regions. UNSD presented a summary of countries' responses to the pre-workshop questionnaire. This was followed by a general discussion.
- Session 4: Tourism statistics and its role in national statistical systems: an overview of challenges and opportunities. The presentations by UNSD and UNWTO were followed by a general discussion.
- Session 5: Basic concepts and definitions. The presentation by UNWTO was followed by country presentation from Russian Federation (NTA), Armenia (NSO) and a general discussion.
- Session 6: Demand perspective. The presentations by UNWTO and UNSD were followed by a general discussion.
- Session 7: Accommodation statistics. The presentation by UNWTO was followed by country presentations from Moldova (NSO), Georgia (NSO) and Kyrgyzstan (NSO) and a general discussion.
- Session 8: Classifications. The presentations by UNSD and UNWTO were followed by country presentations from Kazakhstan (NSO), Ukraine (NSO) and a general discussion.
- Session 9: The supply perspective. The presentation by UNSD and UNWTO was followed by a country presentation from Tajikistan (NSO) and a general discussion.
- Session 10: Employment in the tourism industries. The presentations by ILO and UNWTO were followed by country presentations from Armenia (NTA) and a general discussion.
- Session 11: Data sources. The presentations by UNSD and UNWTO were followed by a country presentation from Belarus (NSO) and a general discussion.
- Session 12: Measuring tourism at sub-national level. The presentation by UNWTO was followed by a country presentation from Russian Federation (NSO) and a general discussion.
- Session 13: Tourism data quality, metadata, dissemination, cooperation between different agencies. The presentations by UNWTO, UNSD and EUROSTAT were followed by a general discussion.
- Session 14 and 15: Group discussion on current data collection practices in the CIS countries: data sources, reliability of data sources, data collection problems, cooperation of NSO, national tourism authority, ministry of economy in data compilation and quality checking practices, problems and solutions.

- Session 16: Tourism Satellite Account: linking the IRTS 2008 and the Tourism Satellite Account: Recommended Methodological Framework 2008. The presentations by EUROSTAT and UNWTO were followed by country presentations from the Central Bank of Ukraine and the National Bank of Moldova.
- Session 17: Roundtable discussion on the implementation of IRTS 2008.

Participants were very active and presented current practices and discussed issues/problems at the time of each presentation by the resource person as well as in the group discussions. The workshop also served as a forum to facilitate better cooperation between the participating countries as well as with the UN Statistics Division and UNWTO.

III. Conclusions and recommendations

At the last session the participants presented a set of recommendations to improve the availability, timeliness and completeness of trade in services statistics in the CIS region and Georgia. They are presented below.

The workshop

I. Legal and institutional framework

1. Recommends to strengthen cooperation and collaboration between national statistical offices, national tourism authorities and central banks to provide a systematic information exchange to establish coordinated work plans, and that all elements of data quality are ensured. Other relevant institutions should also be actively involved in this cooperation (such as finance ministries, border authorities/customs, etc.).
2. Draws the attention of the government and the heads of the organizations/agencies responsible for tourism statistics to the importance of establishing a regular programme of official statistical surveys for collecting good quality data for tourism statistics and making efforts for their funding.
3. Recognizes that several government agencies are involved in collecting data on tourism, recommends that the release of official tourism statistics be executed by the organization responsible for coordination of statistical activities.

4. Suggests that the national institutions involved in the production of tourism statistics meet regularly (at least once a year) and distribute the minutes (findings) of such meeting to the agencies involved.
5. Recognizes the necessity to involve data users in identifying the requirements for data collection and understanding the uses of tourism statistics, including metadata. Emphasizes the importance to meet with data users, execute user satisfaction surveys and modify the tourism statistics programme according to the findings.
6. Suggests that a repository of available methodologies, questionnaires and other supporting documentation be created and made available at the web-site of an appropriate regional/international organization so countries can access them.
7. Suggests that regional meetings on tourism statistics are organized regularly. The theme of the next meeting is foreseen to be the progress in the implementation of the International Recommendation for Tourism Statistics 2008 (IRTS 2008) and the implementation of the Tourism Satellite Account: Recommended Methodological Framework 2008 (TSA 2008).

II. Methodological framework

8. Welcomes the “International Recommendation for Tourism Statistics 2008” (IRTS 2008), particularly the Russian language edition and the “Tourism Satellite Account: Recommended Methodological Framework 2008” (TSA: RMF 2008) and believes that the revised editions provide clear methodological recommendations and that they are closely aligned with the needs of data users and data producers in countries.
9. Considers it highly desirable to update the training manuals for the IRTS and the TSA, including description of good practices on selected IRTS and TSA issues.
10. Considers it necessary to develop the methodology of data collection and compilation of tourism statistics according to international standards, including the assessments of official and administrative data. Countries are open to share their experience in this regard. Encourages countries to use “mirror” statistics as an additional data source.

11. Suggests that producers of tourism statistics make a comprehensive review of their current work to assure that the recommendations and the data requirements of the TSA as a framework would improve data coherence and serve as a guiding principle.
12. Recommends that countries adapt these international recommendations for the production of tourism statistics.
13. Recommends that countries develop an in-depth understanding of the necessary classifications (ISIC/NACE, CPC, CPA and COICOP), and make efforts to get national classifications and methodologies harmonized with the international recommendations.
14. Recognizes that the conceptual framework of SNA and BOP is required for the production of data on tourism to ensure that the data are consistent and can be integrated into SNA and BOP.
15. Recommends that countries implement the recommendations on employment statistics in line with UNWTO and ILO guidelines and make efforts to produce these statistics on a regular basis. Countries are encouraged to share their good practices.
16. Suggests that countries make efforts to analyze tourism industries to learn more about the “non-observed” activities, particularly in employment. Encourages countries to make respective estimates.
17. Advises that countries make efforts to analyze and better distinguish between rented and non-rented accommodation, and share their good practices.
18. Takes note of the importance of defining tourism and especially the definition of “usual environment” and suggests that efforts are made to harmonize the definitions within countries.
19. Recognizes the already existing methodologies available at EUROSTAT, UNSD, UNWTO and other international organizations and encourages better use of these supporting documents.

III. Developing national databases

20. Recognizes the existing databases on tourism statistics in the countries and encourages them to take further steps to collect tourism statistics, and to compile and disseminate them in accordance with IRTS 2008 including the use of:
 - i. International Standard Industrial Classification of All Economic Activities, Rev. 4 (ISIC Rev. 4),
 - ii. Statistical Classification of Economic Activities in the European Community, Rev. 2 (NACE Rev. 2)
 - iii. Statistical Classification of Products by Activity in the European Economic Community, 2008 version (CPA 2008 version)
 - iv. The Central Product Classification 2.0 (CPC 2.0)
 - v. COICOP

IV. Sources and methods of data collection

21. Recommends that organizations/agencies rationalize and harmonize their data collection and sharing practices for the maximum use of tourism data and optimization of resources.
22. Recognizes the importance of applying appropriate survey design techniques in data collection and encourages countries to share their good practices in such areas.
23. Emphasizes the importance that national statistical offices have access to the relevant administrative data sources. Also underlines that confidentiality of individual statistical data is ensured both in the statistical process and in the dissemination of tourism statistics.
24. Requests UNSD and UNWTO to share good practices and provide technical advice in organizing such exchanges.
25. Emphasizes the crucial importance of maintaining detailed metadata on tourism statistics and making appropriate parts of the metadata available in their publications and also in the questionnaires they submit to international organizations. Also recommends countries to review the UNWTO metadata framework proposal and make efforts to assess a country specific implementation of the framework.

V. Distribution and use of tourism data

26. Recommends that agencies responsible for tourism statistics publish their data and their release calendars on the website of the relevant institution and use other relevant media for their dissemination practices.
27. Recommends that countries also include the appropriate metadata in the publications.
28. Suggests that countries make efforts to disseminate their tourism statistics, including metadata not only in their national language, but also in some of the major languages.
29. Agrees that it is necessary to study and synthesize international experience to assess the quality of tourism statistics; recommends that countries publish extensive reports on the quality of national tourism statistics.

IV. LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

No.	Country	Name	Institution
1	Armenia	Mr. Aleksandr Petrosyan	Head, Balance of Payments and External Trade Division National Statistical Service of Republic of Armenia
2	Armenia	Mr. Mekhak Apresyan	Head, Department of Tourism and Territorial Economic Development Ministry of Economy - Republic of Armenia
3	Armenia	Ms. Anush Davtyan	Economist- statistician External Sector Statistics Division - Statistics Department Central Bank of Armenia
4	Azerbaijan	Mr. Rauf Aliyev	Head, Tourism Statistics Department Trade, Service and Tourism Statistics Division The State Statistical Committee of the Republic of Azerbaijan
5	Azerbaijan	Mr. Rahman Orujlu	Head, Division of research works, statistics and license Ministry of Culture and Tourism - House of Government, Azerbaijan
6	Belarus	Ms. Irina Shestakova	Head, Department of Paid Services, Transport, Communications, Science and Innovation Statistics National Statistical Committee of the Republic of Belarus
7	Belarus	Mr. Andrei Martynov	Deputy Director, Tourism Department Ministry of Sports and Tourism of the Republic of Belarus
8	Georgia	Mr. Gogita Todradze	Head, Business Statistics Division National Statistics Office of Georgia
9	Georgia	Ms. Nana Kartvelishvili	Specialist, Office of Planning and Development Ministry of Economic Development of Georgia Department of Tourism and Resorts
10	Kazakhstan	Ms. Sara Nukusheva	Head of Direction Agency on Statistics of the Republic of Kazakhstan
11	Kazakhstan	Ms. Ainur Kaliyeva	Head of division Ministry of Tourism and Sports, Kazakhstan
12	Kyrgyzstan	Ms. Raisa Plesovskih	Head, National Account Department, National Statistical Committee of Kyrgyz Republic

13	Kyrgyzstan	Mr. Elbrus Kalyev	Chief specialist Ministry of Economic Regulation of the Kyrgyz Republic
14	Russia	Mr. Boris Mullokandov	Deputy Head, Department of Statistics of Foreign Trade Federal State Statistics Service Russia
15	Russia	Mr. Alexei Nagorny	Federal State Statistics Service Russian Federation
16	Russia	Mr. Andrej G. Tyutyunnik	Head, Statistics Department Ministry of Sport, Tourism and Youth Russian Federation
17	Russia	Mrs. Tamara Litvinenko	Consultant Ministry of Sport, Tourism and Youth Russian Federation
18	Tajikistan	Ms. Lyubov Zhdanova	Head expert, Department of Trade Statistics and Foreign Economic Relations and Services Agency on Statistics of the President of the Republic of Tajikistan
19	Tajikistan	Mr. Bobokhonov Siyovush Gayratovich	Expert of tourism development Committee of Youth Affairs, Sports and Tourism Tajikistan
20	Ukraine	Ms. Iryna Kalachova	Head, Services Statistics Department State Statistics Committee of Ukraine
21	Ukraine	Ms. Elena Predko	Chief economist, Balance of Payment Department, Central Bank of Ukraine
22	Uzbekistan	Ms. Marina Efimenko	Process Improvement Manager National Company "UZBEKTOURISM" Uzbekistan
HOST COUNTRY			
23	Moldova	Valentina Matveiciuc	Chief specialist, Analysis and macroeconomic forecasting Division, Ministry of Economy Republic of Moldova
24	Moldova	Renata Țurcanu	Chief specialist, Analytical-informational and forecasting Division, Border Guard Service Republic of Moldova

25	Moldova	Victor Dabija	Deputy Head, Current Transactions Statistics Department, Balance of payments Division National Bank of Moldova
26	Moldova	Veronica Potlog	Chief economist, Current Transactions Statistics Department, Balance of payments Division National Bank of Moldova
27	Moldova	Elena Nuța	Head, Tourism heritage and Management of touristic areas Division Tourism Agency of the Republic of Moldova
28	Moldova	Andrei Nica	Consultant in the Tourism heritage and Management of touristic areas Division Tourism Agency of the Republic of Moldova
29	Moldova	Lucia Spoială	General Director, NBS, Republic of Moldova
30	Moldova	Oleg Cara	Deputy General Director of the NBS, Republic of Moldova
31	Moldova	Mariana Eni	Head, Foreign Trade and Services Division NBS, Republic of Moldova
32	Moldova	Svetlana Bulgac	Head, Market services statistics Department, Foreign Trade and Services Division NBS, Republic of Moldova
33	Moldova	Valentina Gîdilica	Head, Macroeconomic Statistics Division NBS, Republic of Moldova
34	Moldova	Elena Vâtcărău	Head, Labor market and Demographic Statistics Division NBS, Republic of Moldova
35	Moldova	Nina Cesnocova	Head, Demographic Statistics Department, Labor market and Demographic Statistics Division NBS, Republic of Moldova
36	Moldova	Ala Negruță	Head, Social and Living Standards Statistics Division NBS, Republic of Moldova
37	Moldova	Igor Mocanu	Head, International Cooperation and European Integration Department NBS, Republic of Moldova
38	Moldova	Ala Pâslariuc	Head, Dissemination and Public Relations Department NBS, Republic of Moldova

39	Moldova	Tatiana Afteni	Consultant, Market Services Statistics Department, Foreign Trade and Services Division NBS, Republic of Moldova
40	Moldova	Ludmila Cecan	Chief specialist, Market Services Statistics Department, Foreign Trade and Services Division NBS, Republic of Moldova
41	Moldova	Oleg Cruglea	Interim Head, General Division for Informational Technologies NBS, Republic of Moldova
42	Moldova	Ecaterina Hîncu	Deputy Head, Trade and Services Statistics Informational Support Department, GDIT NBS, Republic of Moldova
43	Moldova	Natalia Vdovina	Consultant, Trade and Services Statistics Informational Support Department, GDIT NBS, Republic of Moldova
44	Moldova	Olga Nicolaev	Chief specialist, Trade and Services Statistics Informational Support Department, GDIT NBS, Republic of Moldova
45	Moldova	Janeta Savva	Head, General Division for Statistics of Chisinau Municipality, NBS
46	Moldova	Donici Zinaida	Deputy Head, Services Statistics Department, General Division for Statistics of Chisinau municipality NBS, Republic of Moldova
47	Moldova	Miron Marina	Association for Tourism Development in Moldova

REGIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS

48	CISSTAT	Ms. Tatiana Glazkova	Specialist-Expert, Department of Social Sphere and Trade Statistics Interstate Statistical Committee of the CIS Russian Federation
49	EUROSTAT	Mr. Pavel Vancura	Head, Tourism Statistics Section, EUROSTAT
50	ILO	Mr. Igor Vocatch- Boldyrev	Cooperative Branch International Labor Organization (ILO)
51	UNDP	Aurelia Spătaru	UNDP, Project Manager Republic of Moldova
52	UNDP	Dumitru Vasilescu	UNDP, Project Assistant Republic of Moldova

53	UNSD	Mr. Karoly Kovacs	Chief, Statistics of International Trade in Services Section United Nations Statistics Division
54	UNSD	Mr. Nelnan Koumtingue	Associate statistician Statistics of International Trade in Services Section United Nations Statistics Division
55	UNWTO	Mr. Peter Laimer	Statistics Austria/UNWTO
